

## CITY OF FRANKFORT

### Historic Preservation Commission

September 27, 2022

The Frankfort Historic Preservation Commission met at a Regular Meeting on September 27, 2022 in the City Council Chambers, 301 E Clinton St, Frankfort, IN at 5:30PM. The following action was taken:

Bud McQuade was present and called the meeting to order as President. He led the board in the Pledge of Allegiance. Upon roll call, the following members were present: Karen Walter, Gary Comonyak, and Crystal Reichert. Not present: Isac Chavez. Staff members present: Don Stock, Daniel Howe, and Ashlee Bassett.

MINUTES: Minutes from August 23, 2022 meeting were presented for review. Karen Walter notes that important things have happened since the last meeting regarding 508 E Clinton St. Bud McQuade notes that this address is on the agenda for tonight. Karen Walter notes that information received from Indiana Landmarks is pertinent and should be included. Bud McQuade asks for motion to approve. None was heard.

**Motion:** Deny minutes as presented.

**Motion made by:** Bud McQuade

**Second:**

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

Don Stock notes that the minutes should be approved or denied based on what happened at the last meeting. He feels it's unfair for the board to deny the minutes. Bud McQuade states that the board is allowed to approve or disapprove. Don Stock states that they are allowed to approve or disapproved but there must be a reason as to why the minutes were not approved. Don Stock states that the board choosing to deny the minutes will not change what the board has already voted on at the previous meeting. Crystal Reichert adds that she has not had a chance to read over the minutes regarding what was quoted from her at the previous meeting. Nolan Crum (508 E Clinton) asks if the board will vote on his application. Bud McQuade responds that Nolan is on the agenda and his application will be reviewed at the meeting.

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No III- 654 E Washington St for Jose Chavez, Maria Ortega/ Jackie Ortega. Jackie (daughter of owner) and Maria Ortega (wife of owner) are present to represent application. Maria Ortega notes that they would like to replace siding and change windows. Bud McQuade notes that this home is classified as notable. He notes that the West side windows have been changed and OSB is very old and weathered. He asks if this home is a duplex. Maria says no it is only one family. She notes that long ago it used to be a duplex. Bud notes that he asked since he noticed two front doors. He says that the board's job is to make sure that the home stays as historic as possible. Maria says that the siding is wood now. Bud says that since this property is a high-ranking property, they would like to see wood siding repaired instead of vinyl. Karen Walter notes that she visited the home and asks if the property was recently purchased. Maria Ortega says that she bought the house this year. Karen Walter notes approval for wanting to repair the home but that there are significant architectural details that should be preserved. Wood siding is original to home and appears to be in a condition favorable to repaint/ repair instead of covering with vinyl siding. She notes the same for the soffit, including the original wood and bead board. Karen Walter says that the board could consider cement board and the board would like to see the owner save and be true to the architectural details of the home. Containing that detail is a main reason as to why the home is significant to the City of Frankfort. She says that the focus should be on restoring things significant to the home instead of covering them. It appears most windows are original, barring two windows that have already been changed. Karen Walter asks if the original windows can be restored since they can be as energy efficient as new replacement windows. She notes architectural windows in the attic that are significant. Bud McQuade agrees with Karen and says that since the structure is classified as notable, the board would like to have the siding painted and windows repaired versus replaced. Maria Ortega asks if it's okay to remove one of the front doors. Crystal Reichert states that originally it likely had one door. Karen Walter agrees and says that the home next to this one has clear leaded glass

and frames from other windows. Maria Ortega says that they were on the home originally and they were removed. Karen Walter asks if she changed the size of the windows. Maria Ortega says that she put the windows in. Karen Walter recommends voting on this application as presented and having the petitioner do some more research. Karen says in the long run she feels it would be okay to seal up the door, but recommends consulting with Building Services. She again mentions that since the home is notable it should be preserved. Crystal Reichert notes that if the home is going to be repainted, the historic palette should be adhered to. Maria Ortega notes that there are two doors on the East side of the home. She wants to change them. Crystal Reichert asks if it can be seen from the road. Karen Walter says no. Bud McQuade notes that this could become a security issue. Karen Walter asks if this door is a regular door. Maria Ortega says yes. Crystal Reichert notes that if it can't be seen from the street, the board shouldn't vote on it. Karen Walter notes that these doors can be seen from the road. She notes that it appears to be an original door with original glass. She presents a photo to the board. Bud McQuade says that the front is the main focus. Karen Walter says that if it's an existing wooden door, it should be replaced with a wooden door instead of metal.

**Motion:** Deny application as presented, may be resubmitted after consulting with Building Services regarding paint colors and replacement of original wood. Must come back with new information.

**Motion made by:** Karen Walter

**Second:** Crystal Reichert

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No IV- 500 S Harrison St for Dan Perkins. Dan and his wife Deanna are present to represent application. Dan Perkins wants to replace siding, roofing, and new windows/ doors. Dan noted they never received any notification that they exist in the historic district. Karen Walter notes that the home is over one hundred years old, which makes it historic. Karen states that the home has original wood siding on the home underneath the metal siding that is currently on the home. Karen Walter notes that the condition of the wood on the home would like to be preserved. Dan Perkins plans to remove all the material as planned or he can hold off on the project if the board would like. Karen Walter notes that the board is trying to do the best they can to adhere to the standards given to them. Dan Perkins says that he wants to fix the home and make it nice, like his neighbors. Karen Walter says that the work done thus far looks great. She notes that the board would like to preserve what is left of the home. The reason that they had him come before the board was to inform him that he is included in the historical district and if there are historical characteristics on the home that they could be restored or repaired. Bud McQuade asks if letters had been sent out and they had been sent out. He continues that everyone in the Christian Ridge Historical District would have received a letter including Dan Perkins. Bud McQuade asks Don Stock when Christian Ridge was established. Don Stock says that he does not know. Dan Perkins notes that the paper a neighbor received stated it was established in 2015. Bud McQuade says that it has existed for over a hundred years likely. He notes that Mayor McBarnes established this board. He also says that the board is in the process of putting up signage to alert people that they are entering a historic district. Bud McQuade asks if a permit is required for a metal roof. Don Stock says yes but Dan and Deanna didn't put it on, they want to rip off the metal siding and replace with shingles. Dan Perkins says that the total remodel permit was issued in May. Karen Walter notes that she asked Mikayla Passmore if a permit was issued and was told that only cement work was permitted. Don Stock notes that Building Services wraps the permit into one for a total remodel. Crystal Reichert feels like it was inappropriate that the permit was released prior to coming before the board. Crystal Reichert notes to the owners that she understands as to why the homeowner is upset that they had been issued the permit and then had to come before the board. Bud McQuade notes that notifications were mailed to Christian Ridge homeowners about a year ago. Dan Perkins says that his mother-in-law owned the home prior to them and she never mentioned it. Bud McQuade says that metal siding is not appropriate for this home as of now. If it was done prior to the acceptance of these standards, then it's exempt. Dan Perkins says he wants it off the home but if he can't replace it with what he wants, then he would leave it as is.

Crystal Reichert asks if the metal siding is covering the wood. Dan Perkins says that he wants to remove the current siding and replacing with vinyl. He says that if the board wants him to paint his house, the maintenance isn't worth it to him. Karen Walter notes that it's vertical siding (board and batten) and has been there for a while. She recommends considering a cement board siding versus vinyl. Bud McQuade notes that it has the same appeal as vinyl siding. Karen Walter notes that the porch isn't necessarily appropriate for the home. Dan Perkins asks how the board would know if the color is historically correct. Karen notes that with original pictures of the home, it fits correctly.

Karen Walter asks if windows are vinyl or wood. Don Stock says they are both. Deanna Perkins says that there is a window on the side of the house that is a half window and makes it unable to remove the air conditioner. Deanna notes that she wants windows that can open. Crystal Reichert asks why the roof would be replaced. Dan Perkins says he hates metal roofing and wants to replace with shingles. Bud McQuade notes that they would like to replace windows. Dan Perkins says that they want to replace with same size. Bud asks if windows other than vinyl have been explored. Deanna says windows have already been purchased. Crystal Reichert says since this home is contributing, which is not the highest level, the homeowners were given this information and feels as though they would be punishing the Perkins and it is not fair as they were trying to do the right thing. Deanna asks what the home was ranked and what it means. Crystal responds that the state had rated each of the homes in the historical districts. The ratings are Notable, Outstanding, Contributing and Non- Contributing. Crystal Reichert notes that the state classified all homes and explained the ranking system. Dan Perkins asks what makes this home contributing. Bud McQuade says that it's a craftsman style home, built in 1900, and was popular back in the day. Karen Walter asks if the fascia is old or new. Dan Perkins says that is new (a 2x8 covered in metal with vinyl coating). Bud McQuade suggests tabling application until further information can be brought forward. Dan Perkins asks if the siding can be finished. Bud says that he would like to discuss other information before voting on application, hopefully bringing it back up after the meeting.

**Motion:** Table application as presented.

**Motion made by:** Bud McQuade

**Second:** Karen Walter

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No V- 52 E Washington St for Ellis Jewelers (Mike Ellis). No one is present to represent application. Bud McQuade notes that this sign will be painted on the back of the building. Don Stock says it has already been completed. He notes that Building Services was alerted by Crystal Reichert that work was being done. Work was stopped until they could come to this meeting. Don Stock notes that the black background of the sign was made white, and the letters went from white to black. He says that he instructed Ellis Jewelers to stop work on the mural, but it has since been completed. Crystal Reichert notes that she spoke with the artist and told him the process but it has not been followed. Karen Walter notes that they were asked to stop and the request was ignored. Crystal Reichert notes that she knew the colors were going to be reversed and advised the artist to come before the board. Bud McQuade asks if this would require a permit. Don Stock says yes since design was changed. Bud McQuade notes that the email from Kim Stevens states that Main Street 'approved' the project but technically they should have 'no objections.' Don Stock says that Main Street must approve things like this before they come before the board. Bud McQuade asks what Building Services plans to do with this. Don Stock says that they would be required to get a sign permit and the fee would be doubled as a fine. Crystal Reichert notes that it's on the back of the building and would be approved as a mural not as a sign. Don Stock notes that this is classified as a sign since it's painted on metal and mounted on the building. Bud McQuade asks what kind of recourse the board has since it would've required a permit. Don Stock says that if the board approves it the permit would be issued at double the cost. Crystal Reichert states that she feels the board is put into a bad position often. Bud McQuade says that if things were done appropriately, there would be no issue with the sign. It's not the board's job to enforce the policing of this process. Crystal Reichert notes approval of the color switch. Bud McQuade says this was gone about in the wrong way and he feels there's nothing the board can do except approve it. Don Stock says that when Building Services found out about the sign, an email was sent to Bud and Main Street at the same time. He notes that when Main Street approval is received, it's then put on the HPC agenda. Don also says that he spoke with the owner and told him that he must go before the board. He notes that he did tell the owner he could white out the sign prior to the HPC meeting. Crystal Reichert says that she would like to have Building Services be sterner with this process. Bud McQuade says there are procedures to these things and getting people to follow them is not always easy. Crystal notes that she's upset about being blown off by business/ home owners. Bud McQuade notes that the board needs to either approve or deny as is.

**Motion:** Approve application as presented, subject to fine from Building Services.

**Motion made by:** Karen Walter

**Second:** Crystal Reichert

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

Crystal Reichert asks that proof be emailed to HPC to prove that the fine was imposed. Other discussion was had regarding the penalty fee

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No VI- 508 E Clinton St for Nolan Crum. Nolan is present to represent application. This application has been continued from last meeting. Bud McQuade states that the drawings provided don't provide enough information for him and he has some concerns. Bud notes that the drawings don't have the dimensions or additional information and he would prefer that. Bud McQuade notes that there are safety concerns with the condition of the porch currently. Bud notes that he would have preferred that caution tape or something similar been put up with the state of the porch. Nolan Crum adds that he would have thought that tearing down the porch due to the condition would've been suitable. Bud notes that he is wanting to work with Nolan on the improvements of the home and porch. Bud McQuade notes that he doesn't like the idea of the round columns. Nolan Crum states that he would like to mirror the brick columns (3 tiers of brick and then stone). Bud McQuade notes that Tommy Kleckner (with Indiana Landmarks) recommended adding a laminated beam across there. Nolan Crum notes that it is a 33' span but he would prefer to install the supports if allowed. Bud McQuade says he doesn't like to see the interior supports, he asks if metal would be put back in. Nolan Crum says 12.5"x12.5" brick columns would like to be continued up. Karen Walter asks if matching brick has been found. Nolan Crum says that he hasn't purchased anything yet (beside windows). He also notes that he will do what the board says but he wants to move forward. Bud McQuade asks if Nolan received a copy of Tommy Kleckner's recommendation. Nolan says yes. Karen Walter asks if windows were ordered with vertical sashes. Nolan Crum says yes. Karen says she noticed the home had original windows with storm windows and they could be potentially restored if they were able too. She notes that is why they sought Tommy's opinion. Karen Walter notes that the board prohibited the slider windows. Nolan agreed. He also said that he got a permit for the windows. Bud McQuade says the board's decision superseded the letter. He also notes that the home is situated in a neighborhood that has nice homes. Nolan Crum notes that there are 33 windows in the home that have already been purchased according to the board's recommendations. Crystal Reichert notes the board didn't vote on the roof situation- hip vs flat roof. Bud McQuade notes that he wanted to see that on the drawing and he notes a 3-12 pitch. Crystal Reichert says she expected a better picture with dimensions. Bud McQuade asks Daniel Howe (Building Inspector) if the building permit could be issued as is. Daniel Howe says yes and the plans detail exactly what he's doing. Crystal Reichert notes that she wanted to put up nonstructural walls and was told a State approval is required, with architectural drawings stating where the walls would be located and the measurements/etc. Crystal continues that there may be a difference between commercial and residential but is this something normal that would be approved per Daniel. Daniel Howe notes that he met with Nolan Crum today and came up with two scenarios: 1) an LVL that spans 33' with no supports, and 2) 2-ply 16" LVL's spanning full length but had supports on either side of the steps. Either proposal leaves space for the scroll work and the LVL's will be wrapped with whatever is approved (metal, wood). Bud McQuade states that it's important that the Building Inspector feel comfortable with the project. He asks if it's capable of carrying snow load. Daniel Howe says yes, it was designed with the help of an engineer. Nolan Crum notes that Bud McQuade calls for any discussion regarding center supports. Karen Walter notes that since the brick hasn't been sourced, she feels that the 3-ply LVL with no center supports would be most appropriate. She doesn't want to approve without seeing the brick. Bud McQuade notes that he doesn't want the center supports. Gary Comonyak notes that historically the home wouldn't have had the center supports. He says that he would rather see it without the center supports. Some discussion was had regarding 2-ply vs 3-ply. Karen Walter asks if the fascia board has been contracted to be made. Nolan says it has not been paid. Karen notes that if she were in Nolan's position, she asks if it would be replicated exactly. Nolan says that as far as the front of the home, he would take the right side and replace the rest of the left side. Karen Walter asks if there is any need for structural support against the house. Daniel Howe says no if the hip roof is approved, it will be attached to the studs of the home. Karen Walter asks if there's a way to make the hip shorter on the sides. Daniel Howe notes that the pitch of the roof will not form a point. Bud McQuade adds that it will have a slight pitch. Some additional discussion was had regarding the mathematics of the roof. Bud McQuade notes there will not be an issue with the 3/12 pitched roof esthetically because anything less than 3/12 may not be appropriate per the state, insurance, etc. Karen Walter asks Don if there was any additional information given from Tommy Kleckner regarding his agreeance with the pitch roof rather than a flat roof. Don Stock responds that he had waited for his letter to come back as to not misquote Tommy. Don continues that Tommy stated the front porch was not the biggest factor due to the neighboring homes having a similar look, it was not his biggest factor on the home. Bud McQuade asks for a motion to accept the changes on the application, with no center post with a 3/12 pitch.

**Motion:** Approve application as presented, with condition that LVL will not have center supports and there will be a 3-12 pitch on roof. AMENDED: overhang area/ ceiling of porch should be bead board.

**Motion made by:** Gary Comonyak

**Second:** Crystal Reichert

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

Karen comments about fascia/ soffit under porch. Crystal asks the board if the windows should be discussed. Gary Comonyak notes that the windows had been addressed at the previous meeting and it had already been approved. Karen Walter notes that the home owner is making an effort to take the recommendations from the board and as the board moves forward, they have learned something. Karen asks Nolan if he is replacing the soffit on the porch with something similar to the original. Nolan states that fascia on the porch, he would like for it to match the rest of the home. Karen Walter notes that she would prefer for it to stay as similar to original (replicated) since he is taking the same effort for the rest of the home. Nolan notes that he would leave the underneath of the front porch would be open. Bud McQuade states that Nolan should keep the porch as close to original as possible. Nolan asks if the board would like the front fascia to be painted. Bud McQuade notes that painted would fit better with the time frame of the home. Some other discussion was had regarding soffit and fascia prices.

**OTHER BUSINESS:** Waylon Bessler of 363 E Clinton St approaches board and explains he had a contractor submit an application for a metal roof on the deck. He asks for clarification on what is historically appropriate for a wooden deck. Waylon continues that the black metal roof on the detached garage is not on the same parcel as the home. Bud McQuade states that in the HPC Standards passed by the City Council, it states that metal roofs are not allowed. Waylon states that the contractor had received an email including information that Karen Walter had suggested from Mikayla Passmore. Karen notes that the pictures were not of the roofing but the structural design. She continues that this was to help provide examples for the contractor to relay the information from the board as to what may be appropriate design wise that would complement the home. Karen states that this home is also considered Outstanding and is a great example of a historical home in Frankfort. Karen notes again that the email was suggestions for the contractor (Campos) to share with the homeowner. Karen notes that the pictures and examples provided at the meeting per the contractor were an open deck with no sides and a metal roof. Waylon states that the existing structure will stay, and a hip roof was approved. Crystal asks when the application was approved. Bud states that the application was for a deck without a roof. There was mentions of a pergola. Bud McQuade asks the owner if he has considered other types of roofing or if a metal roof is the final decision. The owner states that they would like a roof on the deck. Bud McQuade suggests of different products that are similar to the metal look. Waylon asks if copper would be acceptable. Bud responds that he doesn't believe it would be since it will still be a metal roof. Bud McQuade states maybe there is a variance of some type that he would be able to ask for. Karen Walter adds that if the porch was located in the rear of the home with a smaller pitch to the roof, it may have been something the board would've considered but it is located in the side lot of the property. The board must treat this structure as an attached structure to the home and will be visible. Bud McQuade states that the HPC board is has only been in action for a few years and unfortunately are not in control of what may have happened before the board. Don Stock adds there is an appeal process. Karen Walter notes that the location of the structure is important to the architectural design and it takes away from the home. Crystal Reichert asks if the owner will need to re-present the application to the board. Karen Walter adds that the board would like a better idea for how the porch would be covered for a future application. Karen asks Waylon if they are wanting to leave the structure as is and attach the roof or rebuild. Waylon states that he would leave it as is. Karen recommends for the owner to resubmit an application.

**OTHER BUSINESS:** Agenda Item No IV- 500 S Harrison St for Dan Perkins was continued from earlier. Karen Walter notes that she feels the board is in a similar situation to Nolan Crum's. Bud McQuade notes that these homeowners are not the only ones that are not aware they live in a historic district. Karen Walter asks if the wood on the porch will be kept. Deanna Perkins says yes. Karen Walter asks what color for the shingles. Deanna Perkins says Estate Grey or Sierra Grey. Karen Walter notes that the windows are vinyl already. Bud McQuade notes that it is classified as the lowest tier. Karen Walter notes she would like to see the neighborhood revived. Crystal Reichert notes that the roofing is great. Karen Walter notes that the color of the siding is great.

**Motion:** Approve application as presented.

**Motion made by:** Karen Walter

**Second:** Crystal Reichert

**Roll Call:**

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Gary Comonyak

With the caveat that the permit is brought in from the owner. Crystal adds that the permit will not change the vote, only to provide additional information to the board.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Unanimous voice vote to adjourn meeting.

Minute's summary typed by Ashlee Bassett filling in for Mikayla Passmore.

Respectfully submitted,

Ashlee Bassett