

CITY OF FRANKFORT

Historic Preservation Commission

August 23, 2022

The Frankfort Historic Preservation Commission met at a Regular Meeting on August 23, 2022 in the City Council Chambers, 301 E Clinton St, Frankfort, IN at 5:30PM. The following action was taken:

Bud McQuade called the meeting to order as President. Upon roll call, the following members were present: Karen Walter, Isac Chavez and Bud McQuade. Staff members present: Mikayla Passmore (Secretary).

MINUTES: Minutes from August 16, 2022 meeting were presented for review.

Motion: Approve Minutes as submitted.

Motion made by: Isac Chavez **Second:** Karen Walter

Roll Call:

- Yay- Bud McQuade, Isac Chavez, Karen Walter
- Abstain- Crystal Reichert

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No III 508 E Clinton for Nolan Crum. Nolan states that he is wanting to replace the roof. It is half way started, 3/4ths of the way up from the previous owners and it is visible where the new roofing stops. The shingles that are presented in the application is also currently on the home. Nolan continues that the front porch has fallen in. Karen asks if this was a recent event, and Nolan responds that the home has sat empty for about 10 years. The porch has fallen in sometime in the past years per the neighbors. Karen clarifies if Nolan has recently bought the home and Nolan responds yes. Nolan continues that they plan to remove the damaged areas from the front porch and the previous owners had covered up some detailing on the front porch. For example the brick work. Karen states that the fascia board has a relief wood trim that goes across the front of the porch. Nolan states that the fascia board is rotted in the middle. Karen asks if Nolan has thought about getting the board remade. Nolan responds no he hadn't plan to but there was metal covering it before so it wasn't visible. Karen states that the detail on the home is very stunning and the fascia is an architectural feature on this home that is beautiful. Crystal adds that this home is a notable home. Karen asks if the owner is familiar with Henry Pour in Lafayette. They have a custom carpentry department and if a piece of the fascia is salvageable, it could be taken into them to for potential replication. Karen recommends for the owner to have this done for both the integrity of the home along with the historical element to keep in place. Nolan responds that the only concern is with the way the porch was built with the flat roof, he is worried about the longevity of the porch. He states that they planned to add a pitch to the front porch roof without disturbing much of the siding. Crystal asks the owner if he has had an architectural or structural engineer look at the front porch. Crystal states that when looking at what Nolan had typed out for his application, he had stated "I believe that the design of the roof was the reason the roof had failed." Nolan states that adding the pitch is what he is looking to do. Crystal responds that she doesn't agree with the statement "I believe" because the home is notable so by changing the roofline it would change the appearance. Crystal continues to state that if a structural engineer gave a report on why the structure failed and how to correctly fix it, she would be more likely to approve the changes. She states that the picture provided doesn't show if there had been any supports on the edge or if there had been some at one point but then removed. Nolan states in the middle of the porch everything had rotted, so there is no longer any evidence of support there anymore. Crystal states that the owner should fix that specific area to avoid it from falling in rather than changing the pitch. Nolan asks for clarification. Crystal responds that she is hesitant to approve the new pitch of the roof due to his statement in his application "I believe" verses having an architect or structural engineer's opinion on why the roof line failed. Nolan asks if that particular statement was removed, she would still be opposed to the change of the pitch for the front porch roof. Karen adds that she believes that Crystal is meaning the collapse of the roof could have been the material used, or how long the house had sat without any maintenance rather than if the structure itself was built improperly or unsound. Karen continues that with an opinion from the architect or engineer it may state that the original structure was sound but just over time took on damage. She continues and suggests to Nolan to repair the roof while staying the same pitch of the roof rather than changing it. Karen states that he could use a very low

pitched metal roofing or another type of material to give a slight elevation to the roof. Karen states that she does agree with Crystal that the board wants to make sure they are not making a change on the home because the owner believes that the roof failed due to the pitch and not the materials used. Nolan states that he wants to make the change because it has been damaged for several years. Nolan adds that he can start the roofline in the same place as it is currently, but make the front fascia smaller. He proceeds to ask Karen if he would be able to have a smaller decorative fascia board across the front rather than what is there currently and use regular shingles. Karen responds that she does understand why Nolan is wanting to make the changes but there is a reason as to why this home has sat empty for so long. It is due to the amount of work that will have to go into it both interior and exterior. The HPC goal is to keep as much exterior as similar as possible per Karen. Karen proceeds that on the interior, once the material is ripped down to the windows, he will most likely notice that the windows in place are not original and they have been modified. She also assumes that the doors would be the same as well. Karen states with that being said, the hope for the board in attempt to restore the home, that the owner is willing and wanting to preserve the integrity of the historical value of the home as intended. Karen states that the latos in the front are very rear and it is one of the reason it is notable. Nolan adds there has been visible work done to the home that has taken away from the historical value of the home. Bud asks what Nolans' intentions are for this property and Crystal agrees. Nolan states that he plans to fix the home up and sell it. Crystal states that she doesn't agree with the idea of flipping the home. Bud states that the HPC board is driven to uphold the historical character of the properties as much as possible. Some issues that have been brought before the board will be discussed in detail regarding the historical value of the home. Bud continues that making simple changes that will make the home look better really may affect the historical value in the long run. Nolan responds that some of the material and damage to the home is not helping either because it will cause more issues down the road as well. Bud state that the flat roofs are very prevalent in the downtown area and is just asking that he takes a look at the architectural situations of this home. He asks that Nolan that with the work that he does continue to keep the same look. Bud asks if he will be tearing off the roof. Nolan states that there is one layer on the roof right now. Bud asks Don if his office has been down to take a look at the layers on the roof. Don responds that Daniel has been there but he has not. Bud asks if there is a layer of wood shingles underneath the shingles currently. Nolan responds no there is only decking underneath. Crystal adds that her garage is similar in the sense that it does have a pitched roof but doesn't have any weight support (like the front porch at 508 E Clinton) and continues that it is starting to sag or fall as well. She continues that the metal supports may not be enough to hold up his roof. Nolan states that he intends to install columns by the doors where the old columns had failed. Bud asks why he intended to use round columns. Nolan states that the rest of the homes in the neighborhood it will match. Karen states that without looking at the rest of the neighborhood, it will be harder to judge what would be appropriate. Bud restates that the board is only voting on the exterior. Nolan states that he is trying to figure out what the board is asking for with adjustments. Bud states that some of the issues that the board is speaking on may be structural. Don adds that the bones of the home are stable. Bud adds that they are speaking on the front porch. Don asks and reiterates that the board is looking at aesthetics. Is the flat roof versus the pitched roof would it look appropriate and what are his options. He states to Nolan that this board is to continue the preservation of the historical parts of town and not trying to drive the price up for work or etc. for the owners. He continues that the home that Nolan has is Notable and this is one of the highest rankings on the list. The higher the ranking, the more the board will be particular on types of work that can be done. Don asks Karen due to her background, does she believe that this home did at one time have a flat roof or a pitched roof. Karen responds to Nolan the she would recommend spending the \$500 and hiring KJG to come give their opinion on the structure. She states that this will remove any assumptions on the structure and insure that when the house is sold, it will be structurally sound. Crystal agrees. Especially to protect Nolan if someone were to come back and accuse him of selling an un-structurally sound home. Don states that with this concern will be through the building services office and not the HPC board. Karen states that they will also give historically advice for this home as well. Don continues that he doesn't want the board to make it seem as though since he is flipping the home it's not correct. Crystal states that since he is wanting to change the pitch of the roof she would recommend getting another opinion that way if all he needed was to add more support he could do that instead of a more extensive process. Bud states that there has been other roofs in town built similar or with a slight pitch but weather can weigh a lot on the structure. Karen adds that Ryan Haynes down the road owns a historical home and he is an architect, he may be willing to give an opinion on the home as well. She continues that she is trying to offer suggestions for the home and process to help. Crystal adds that he is also wanting to change the windows. Karen states that anything seen from the road will be voted on before the board. Bud asks if the pitch is changed, would it cause any issue for the windows. Nolan responds that he didn't plan to have any issue with the windows only going as far as he could. Nolan continues that he could install the roof exactly as is. Karen states that she is unsure with the materials presented for the flat roof. Nolan states that the columns have been wrapped in aluminum and they are not original. Karen states that this most

likely is a part on the contribution to the damage and rot. Nolan states again that he could re-install everything as it was, not that it would be his first choice but would. Bud states that he wants more details for the application. Giving other options for the material choices as well. Karen states that she has also gone through the restoration and renovation process for her home and would recommend getting in contact with Ron Crews regarding the roofing. Potentially installing an appropriate metal roofing to help the lifespan. Karen states that she understands that he is wanting to move forward but the board is looking to not approve the application until further detailed information is provided. Crystal asks about the windows. Nolan states the he planned to remove the small window in the middle and reside the home. He continues that the top windows are most likely original but are not staying closed etc. Crystal states that it seems as though the windows have a specific transom, and she wouldn't vote yes for this application until further information is given about the windows. Nolan states that there is a picture provided in the application stating what type of window he plans to install. Nolan asks if the mullions were installed would that be acceptable. Crystal states that the board is not in favor of removing original windows as well. Then proceeds to ask if Nolan will be installing siding over the existing window framing of the small window on the front or completely fix and reside that part of the home. Nolan states that he has extra siding that is currently on the home and he would fix it properly. Nolan asks if he is able to move forward on the soffit, fascia, siding and windows only on the home but not on the front porch. He continues that most of the material is not original any more. Don states that he doesn't want for Nolan to be drug out an additional month and that he would be able to continue on with the project beside from the porch. Karen states that she would recommend the vertical mullions only. Bud adds that the middle window in the closet doesn't really serve a purpose any longer. Bud asks for a motion.

Motion: To approve the application for 508 E Clinton as presented to finish the main roof, finish and change the fascia and soffit, may install windows with vertical mullions, but not in favor of removing the small window in the front.

Motion made by: Karen Walter

Second: Crystal Reichert

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Isac Chavez, Gary Comonyak, Bud McQuade

Other discussion was had regarding the safety of the porch.

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No IV 53 Main Ave for Mark Ford. Mark is wanting to replace the gutters on the house and garage as well as the existing windows. Mark states that there are no gutters on the home currently but research states that when the roof was done in the past the previous gutters were removed and never re-installed. The owner is looking to replace 14 windows in the home, keeping them as similar as possible to what is currently installed but he states the existing windows do not look to be original. The one change they are looking to make is the front window is a three window unit and would like to replace with a one window unit replacement. Bud asks if the owner has looked into a custom window to be installed instead of a single unit. Mark responds that he has. He also has a contractor already picked as well. Crystal asks about the information provided in the packet but would like a clarification of which type of window. Karen states that she does agree with the replacement gutters and would like to know where the slider windows would be installed. Mark adds one will be in the upstairs rear. Bud asks if it will be the front or north side. Mark responds not in the front, but his wife was the one who had planned the windows and where the new sliders would be installed. Karen adds that the windows in the home are double hung and not slider windows. Mark adds the slider windows would be in the side and rear of the home and possibly in the dining room. Karen asks if there will be vertical mullions in the new windows. Crystal suggests a picture from google images for reference on the home if there are mullions. Karen asks if the owner is changing the siding or painting the brick on the porch. Mark responds no to both, and the only changes will be the windows. Karen states that she would be in favor of the replacement windows but not the slider windows since there is no a clear location of where they will be and would prefer a regular double hung window. Bud asks why they had decided on the sliders. Mark responds that his wife had made the decision. Bud asks if the windows being replaced will be the same size as what is in currently. Mark responds yes. Karen states that the board has stayed consistent on voting for specific windows to stay the same size or style that have an architectural value to the home and would recommend that Mark does the same for the picture window in the front of the home. Mark responds that he is not opposed to have it stay as three window units however if it was replaced as one unit, they are planning to install dividers or mullions in the window to have the same visual affect. Bud states even if three window units are installed versus one windows unit there would be mullions that would be visible from the road, and this would allow for the mullions to be installed it would give the same

affect. Bud agrees with Karen's statement regarding the picture window in the front of the home to stay the same as what is currently in. Mark states that he has discussed with his wife regarding multiple windows verse one unit in the front and it has just been preference but would be okay with either. Bud asks if there is a motion. Additional discussion was had mid-motion regarding the slider windows. Mark states that the windows located in the side/rear bedroom of the home overlooking the garage are not original windows. Bud asks Mark what time frame they are looking at for replacement. Mark responds they planned to call the contractor after the meeting and order the windows then.

Motion: Accept the windows as double hung and that they will be all the same size and architectural framing (the three windows on the front), the sliders are not approved unless the home owner knows the exact location of the windows, and approving the 6" gutters and downspouts.

Motion made by: Karen Walter

Second: Crystal Reichert

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Isac Chavez, Crystal Reichert, Bud McQuade

Motion was amended later in the meeting after owner had come back. Some discussion was had regarding two slider windows. Bud suggests to the board that they amend the previous motion.

Motion: Amend and allow for 11 double hung windows and two sliders with horizontal mullions in the sliders.

Motion made by: Karen Walter

Second: Crystal Reichert

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Isac Chavez, Crystal Reichert, Bud McQuade

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No V 702 E Washington St for Mary Mangis. The owner is wanting to extend the current fence roughly 24' to the west, which is about 4.5' past the home. Crystal asks if this will be in the rear of the home. Karen adds that this property is a corner lot. Mary agrees. Mary continues that there is a lane in the rear of her home that was used for a local school in the neighborhood. The lane has a sidewalk in the rear. Karen asks if the proposed fence will go up to the sidewalk in the rear. Mary states no, it won't go back that far. Mary states that she plans to put solar lighting on or around the fence to avoid any electrical work. Mary states that the fence is recycled and is about 14 years old. It has been pretreated, and she had got it from another couple. Mary states she plans to paint the fence with the historical paint from Sherwin Williams. She also plans to install a gate on the fence as well, most likely in the rear or front facing South. Karen asks if Don has seen the fence. Dons states that he hasn't seen the fence only a picture. Mary did bring in a sample of the fence for the board to see. Crystal references the application and the color swatches given, if this would be the color Mary plans to use. Mary states yes and it will be a deep / rich brown color. Bud asks Don if the recycled fence will be structurally sound. Mary states that she has twice as much fence to be able to swap out any pieces that may not be sound. Bud states that his only concern is since it is used and has been out in the weather for 14 years that this will be a secure material to be used. He states that he doesn't want for it to look as though it could fall over. Both Mary and Karen reiterate that she will be painting the fence to help the life of the fence as well. Don states that there is not anything stating what the owner cannot use in the standards. Bud clarifies to the owner that with the neighborhood that she is located in, he wants to make sure it matches the appearance as the rest of the neighborhood. Karen asks if this is the only project that she is asking approval for. Mary states yes as of right now, and she will be having help but mainly installing the fence herself. She continues that she plans to repaint the house within the next year or so as well but not on this application. Mary states that the 4x4 posts are brand new.

Motion: To approve the application for 702 E Washington St. as presented.

Motion made by: Isac Chavez

Second: Karen Walter

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Isac Chavez, Crystal Reichert, Bud McQuade

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No VII 363 E Clinton for Kristina Campos. Owners had gotten a permit in 2020 with the HPC approval for a deck only. They had hired Campos for complete the job by installing a roof over the deck. Kristina has called in to renew the permit and had been informed that the previous permit and HPC approval was ONLY for the uncovered deck. The owner is now wanting to install a black metal roof to match the garage in the rear. Kristina states that they are wanting a hipp style roof as well. Crystal asks when the garage was installed because it appears new. Kristina responds that the owners stated previously they had bought the lot directly next to their current property and had demoed the garage/ rebuilt a garage. Kristina had asked the homeowners if there was an approval given from the HPC, and they stated that the board wasn't in effect at that time. Crystal states that the board was formed about 9 years earlier. Karen asks if this new roof addition to the deck will be visible from the road. Kristina responds yes, it is visible from the road and from the side view as well. Kristina continues that the posts have already been install, so their company would only be framing the roof and installing it. The home owner had installed the posts themselves. Karen asks Don if this structure is/seems solid. Don responds yes the structure seems solid. Crystal asks the board if the metal roofing standards for the homes also fall onto additional structures. Bud asks for a motion from the board.

Motion: To deny the application as presented with a metal roof unless another material is provided to correlate with the home better.

Motion made by: Crystal Reichert

Second: Karen Walter

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Bud McQuade
- Abstain - Isac Chavez

Some additional conversation was had regarding different roof pitches.

NEW BUSINESS: Agenda Item No VI 5/7/9 S Main for David Meek. David is looking to install new windows but using the same identical windows as used in Beardsley's building. He will be uncovering all the windows in the rear of the building as well as the billboard to be removed. His intentions for this building will be an air BNB. Crystal asks about the windows that have a curve. Don replies that those windows will be custom made. Karen asks if he will be using the city funds. Don responds yes. Karen asks what may be behind the billboard. Don responds that he is unsure but the billboard is not legal with the ordinances now. Karen states for clarification that there is an unsure thought of what is behind the billboard but if there are windows, they will be replaced. Don agrees. Don states that if there is any advertising that is wanting to be reaplced back up, he could paint like Little has done down the street. Bud asks for a motion.

Motion: To approve the application as presented for all new windows and any tuck-pointing repair.

Motion made by: Karen Walter

Second: Isac Chavez

Roll Call:

- Yay-Karen Walter, Crystal Reichert, Bud McQuade, Isac Chavez

Unanimous decision to dismiss meeting.

Minute's summary typed by Mikayla Passmore.

Respectfully submitted,

Mikayla Passmore